Law Offices of Bruce M. Merrill, P.A. A Professional Corporation 225 Commercial Street/Suite 501 Portland, Maine 04101

> TELEPHONE: (207)775-3333 FAX: (207)775-2166 E-MAIL: mainelaw@maine.rr.com

Bruce M. Merrill Member ME, NJ, NY & PA Bars

September 13, 2006

<u>via</u> FAX @ 207/287-2814 and by regular mail

Matthew Scott, Chair Maine Board of Environmental Protection State House Station 17 Augusta, ME 04333-0017

Re: Friends of Merrymeeting Bay, et al., Second Petition To Modify Water Quality Certifications Of Dams On The Androscoggin River

Dear Chairman Scott and Member of the Board of Environmental Protection:

This is in response to Mr. Manahan's September 8, 2006 letter regarding Friends of Merrymeeting Bay's ("FOMB") request that the full Board consider the second petition to modify water quality certifications of dams on the Androscoggin River ("Andro II Petition"). FOMB's request was made in an August 30, 2006 letter to the Chairman Scott and members of the Board.

Mr. Manahan does not address the point that, pursuant to 38 M.R.S.A. Section 341-D and DEP Rules Ch. 2, Section 27, FOMB is entitled to a decision from the full Board as to whether to grant a hearing on the Andro II Petition, and that this decision was to be made within thirty days of the petition's submission. The issues of "appeal" to the full Board or "reconsideration" are not implicated because the Chairman's action was ultra vires, that is, without statutory or regulatory authority.

Ignoring this point, Mr. Manahan instead assumes the Chairman has the power to hold the petition in abeyance, and argues first, that such a decision is not reviewable because a hearing has not been scheduled. This argument is contradicted by Mr. Manahan's own description of Chapter 30, Section 24, which provides for Board review of a Chairman's ruling: "Chapter 30, Section 24 provides that the Chair may be overruled by a majority vote of the Board on any decision or ruling relating to a hearing

Matthew Scott, Chair Page Two September 13, 2006

. . . " Obviously, the ruling at issue here "relates" to a hearing, thus the full Board has the power to review it.

Second, Mr. Manahan argues that the request for full Board review is untimely. However, Mr. Manahan does not - and cannot - point to any deadline in the rules for filing such a request. The Board is not inconvenienced, and the dam operators are not prejudiced, by the timing of the request. Nor, it should be noted, would an "unworkable" precedent be set by having full Board review, as Mr. Manahan suggests. Board rules already provide for Board review of rulings, without any limitation as to their subject matter. Certainly a review of a ruling on something as fundamental as to whether to hold a hearing would not undermine the efficiency of Board operations.

In any event, even if there is considered to be a 60-day deadline to file a request for full Board review (and FOMB maintains that no such deadline exists), the request for full Board review was filed within 60 days of FOMB learning that the full Board, in fact, did not participate in the decision to hold the Andro II Petition in abeyance. That the Board did not participate in that decision was not stated in the June 9, 2006 letter from Chairman Scott, and FOMB learned from BEP staff that this was the case only on July 5, 2006, less than 60 days before the FOMB request for full Board review was submitted.

Third, Mr. Manahan revives the dam operators' request that the Andro II Petition be denied. A response to this argument was filed on June 7, and it will not be repeated here. In any event, a decision to dismiss the petition clearly can only be made by the Board. It is apparent that the dam operators themselves want a decision as to whether or not a hearing will be granted on the Andro II Petition, and so it would seem that it is in all the parties' interests to have the full Board make that ruling.

Sincerely,

Bruce M. Merrill, Attorney for FOMB and on Behalf of other Andro II Petitioners

cc: Mr. Ed Friedman, FOMB Mr. Douglas Watts Androscoggin Service List